

WEST TISBURY COMMUNITY WORKSHOP #1: SUMMARY OF RESULTS

Prepared by JM Goldson 10/12/16, revised 10/31/16

Summary

The purpose of the first of three community workshops in West Tisbury was to introduce participants to the Housing Production Plan (HPP) project scope and schedule, to discuss housing needs in the community and Island-wide, and to develop a preliminary housing vision for the community and the Island.

The following themes emerged as residents considered the current housing environment in West Tisbury and ideas for the future of housing in their community: desire for more diverse housing types, pockets of density, and more funding strategies.

Workshop participants envisioned low-density clusters of diverse housing types that serve the needs of young families and downsizing seniors, including townhouses, tiny houses, larger houses converted to multi-family units, and mixed use development. Participants discussed small pockets of density that could help address the housing needs while protecting the community's important agricultural resources, particularly through cohousing, cooperative-style housing, and/or cluster housing development. In addition, participants saw dormitory housing, campgrounds, and tiny houses to help address need for seasonal workforce housing. Participants discussed the need for creative infrastructure to support appropriate density in North Tisbury center and funding strategies to help ensure that the town is able to respond to opportunities quickly.

Workshop Design

The workshop took place in the West Tisbury Public Services building on Monday September 19, 2016 from 4-6:30pm. Thirty-nine people attended. The purpose of the workshop was to engage West Tisbury community members in an interactive process that both informs and solicits ideas.

- Information: A presentation gave participants an introduction to the purpose of a Housing Production Plan, affordability criteria, and indicators of housing need.
- Public input: Working in small groups, participants outlined a housing vision for their town and the Island and also identified opportunities and obstacles in the community and the Island to address housing needs.

Methods

The workshop consisted of a presentation and digital group polling as well as small group discussions and other informal exercises. To start, participants placed a pin on a map of

Martha's Vineyard to show where they live, and then using post-it notes they answered two questions to create a word cloud, "Describe a quality you like about West Tisbury," and "Describe a quality you like about Martha's Vineyard."

Before the consultants' presentation, participants worked in pairs or threesomes to interview each other about how long they have lived on the Vineyard and housing issues.

Consultants Jennifer Goldson and Judi Barrett described the purpose and process of creating a Housing Production Plan and re-enforced the need for community insight and input into the process. The presentation also included preliminary findings from the recently completed draft Housing Needs Assessment, as well as digital group polling.

After the presentation, participants worked for one hour in small groups of 4-8 on three discussion topics. To start, participants discussed the presentation they heard and considered the information together as a group-- What was a surprise to them? What unanswered questions were they left with? Next, the groups developed a vision of their community and the Island with a range of housing options that satisfy the needs of multiple groups and users. What would that look like?

Lastly, groups identified the real-world opportunities and obstacles to achieving this vision. At the close of the workshop, a representative from each table presented some of the ideas their group identified.

Interviews

The interviews consisted of five questions designed to record how long participants have lived on the Vineyard and in this community, and how their housing needs may have changed over that time. In addition, the questions captured participants' ideas about the Island's and their community's housing needs.

Most participants have been part of the Vineyard community for at least fifteen years and some for thirty to forty years. One has lived on the Island for more than seventy years. Most moved to West Tisbury after living elsewhere on the Island. People have lived in tents and cabins, guest houses and apartments though most have lived primarily in single family homes. Housing needs have changed throughout people's lives as they need a larger or more permanent home to raise children in and then a smaller home as their children grow up or they become single.

People identified a variety of housing needs such as more rental units, more housing for seniors or downsizing families, single family ownership opportunities and seasonal workforce housing - though most noted affordability as the greatest need. Finally, participants noted that housing needs across the Island are the same though the environments town-to-town differ. For instance, West Tisbury is rural and more expensive and Down-Island towns have higher density and more diversity of people and housing.

Digital Group Polling

Group polling enables workshop organizers to get a picture of who participants are and what brought them to the workshop. How long have they lived on the Vineyard? How long have they lived in their current homes? Are they homeowners or renters? Year-round or seasonal?

Lived on the Vineyard

- Sixty-seven percent of respondents have lived on the Vineyard for 20 years or more.
- Twelve percent have lived in the Island for 10-20 years
- Nineteen percent have lived on the Island from ten to fewer than five years.

Moved to Current Home

- Forty-six percent of respondents moved into their current homes between 1990 and 2009.
- Forty percent of participants moved into their current homes since 2010.
- Few participants moved into their current homes before 1979, just 10%.

Own/Rent

- Sixty-seven percent of participants own their own homes and live in them year-round.
- Two percent of attendees live in their own homes part-time.
- Fourteen percent of respondents rent their homes year-round, and seven percent live in seasonal rentals.
- Ten percent chose “Other.”

Primary Reason for Attending Workshop

- Fifty percent responded that they attended in order to advocate for affordable housing.
- The next largest group, 20 percent, were there to gather information.
- Ten percent attended to ensure the community’s economic vitality and another ten percent to protect community integrity.
- Seven percent were there for “Other.”

Small Group Discussions

Participants worked in groups of four to eight on three discussion topics. To start, groups considered the information they heard in the presentation (Part A). What surprised them? What questions did they have after the presentation? The second discussion topic (Part B) asked participants to formulate a “perfect-world” vision of housing in their community and the Island as a whole. Finally, in Part C, groups considered what real world opportunities and obstacles exist to help or hinder their vision coming to fruition.

Part A – Debriefing

Groups expressed surprise and concern about a variety of things they heard in the presentation. Specifically, people were alarmed by the high number of housing cost burdened residents in West Tisbury and the high cost of housing, from purchase to construction, as well

as the shortage of year-round rentals. Projected demographic shifts which point to a growth in older adults and a loss of people under age 19 were surprising also. How will this affect the life of the town, from provision of services to economic health?

Part B - Visioning

West Tisbury

Groups agreed that West Tisbury does a poor job of meeting the town's housing needs. Some factors that contribute to this assessment include three-acre residential zoning that favors single family housing and does not encourage housing development to serve people of different ages or differing needs. One group also noted that housing cost burden may drive residents to try to generate income by renting their homes seasonally which only worsens housing problems.

West Tisbury residents value the rural, agricultural nature of their town. Groups' housing visions protected the rural aspects of the town while increasing opportunities for housing development by proposing cluster housing and co-housing and many "dense pockets" of housing. Groups envision a greater diversity of housing in West Tisbury, from townhouses to apartments in re-purposed large homes. These would increase the rental housing stock and could serve the growing senior population who may need smaller homes or service enriched housing.

Groups also favored combining residential and commercial development in order to increase business opportunities and job opportunities. This vision also encompasses economic diversification, moving the local economy away from a seasonal tourism based economy. Currently the economy is dependent on tourism and as such, seasonal workers should have seasonal dormitory-style or hostel-style housing.

Island-wide

Although participants recognize that the whole Island has affordable housing challenges, the Down-Island towns have more density and apartment buildings than West Tisbury, which is more open and more expensive. Participants thought that the Island's housing stock poorly meets the needs of the population and that there is not enough diversity or housing stock and prices are too high. Participants envisioned that the down-island towns provide more small unit housing because the services are there and that there would be more island-wide planning solutions such as an island-wide tax to fund community services and affordable homes. There is more cost sharing for Island-wide affordable housing programs and more employee housing opportunities across the Island. Participant's envisioned that the Island would learn to "play better together" and "lose the border war."

Part C - Opportunities and Obstacles

West Tisbury

In identifying opportunities and obstacles, groups recognized that there are some things that may be both. These include zoning which is currently an obstacle to residential development

that anything but a single family home on a three-acre lot. Zoning could be amended to favor more diverse housing types and increased density. Seasonal home owners are another opportunity and obstacle. They may be resistant to changes in the community or revenue strategies that target them but they also represent a potentially wealthy and well connected group who own homes that are vacant for some portion of the year. Their buy-in and participation is essential.

There is a shortage of funding for affordable housing development. Creative tax levies and incentives can alleviate this shortage. Some of these include real estate taxes that are based on income or are reduced for year-round residents or landlords that rent year-round; institution of a room tax on weekly rentals or a local sales tax with revenues directed to an affordable housing fund. CPA funds can be more strategically leveraged. These monies would go to a town fund to buy older properties or land before a developer can.

Island-wide

The Land Bank model should be applied to generate funding for affordable housing development across the Island. Other opportunities that participants identified for the Island were a real estate tax for housing (like the Land Bank), loans for tiny houses, taxing seasonal rentals, implementing a room tax on weekly rentals, adopting a residential tax exemption, building on larger parcels in other towns, Island-wide planning, and more education. Participants also saw opportunities to provide more capacity to regional housing organizations.

Participants also identified many obstacles including refusal by towns to be regional, town-centric funding concerns, and six towns with different identities. In addition, participants saw the need for environmental protections, lack of a living wage, prohibitive zoning, and lack of awareness from seasonal residents about the housing issues as obstacles.

APPENDIX I: WELCOMING EXERCISES

MAP

Place a pin on the map of the Island where you live



Most participants of the West Tisbury workshop lived in West Tisbury, particularly scattered across the central areas. Two participants indicated they resided in Tisbury and one in Oak Bluffs.

WORD CLOUDS

Describe a quality you like about West Tisbury

- It's in the middle
- The people—range of young and old, open to new ideas, beautiful
- Sense of community
- Farm country life, diverse lifestyle, good zoning by-law, control of density
- My true home
- Creative
- Some farms, more woods, crickets
- Mid-Island, central, farms
- Local farming
- Beauty
- State forest
- An agricultural community, human scaled
- Dog walks on beach at sunrise
- Younger families and rural character
- Great people, library, beach
- Friendly

Describe a quality you like about Martha's Vineyard

- Rural beauty and cultural diversity
- Friends and family
- Resistant to "fast track" development, all caring, nature
- Intact community
- Diverse interesting population
- Character of community
- Walking trails, conservation land
- Small size

APPENDIX II: INTERVIEWS

1. Find a partner
2. Ask you partner the following questions and record their answers.

	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	35 years/10 years
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, apartment, guest house
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Moved 30x in 35 years, finding it more and more difficult to find affordable housing
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Affordable rental housing, adjust zoning to allow tiny houses
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	No difference. Down-island towns have more density and apt buildings. None of this WT, need allowances for greater density, more senior housing
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	23 years
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family with parents
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, need own home
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Housing for young adult natives who want to stay
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	WT more open than down island towns
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	38 years summer
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	They will, is a widow
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Intelligent planning, needs of aging
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	We are more agricultural and more expensive

	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	25/10
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, apt and accessory units
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, needed more space
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	More housing for the elderly
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	No difference, the whole Island has AH challenges
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	48/40
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	larger home for a larger family
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Affordable single family housing
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Same-regional approach
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	35
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Definitely. Change in income-owner/renter
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Affordable housing, needs of aging community
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	WT is more expensive
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	1943/1963
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Downsizing after kids left
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	To build more housing

5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	No difference
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	24/18
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, guest house
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	No permanent housing, then needed bigger space
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Need for permanent affordable housing who fall outside income restrictions, own and rent
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Less rentals
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	30/25
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family rental then own
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	25 years still building a home, month to month budgeting. That's a better class of problem
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Lack of island wide planning, coordination and cost sharing
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	NA
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	12/5
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	SF, apartment, guest house, shed with house privileges
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, gotten married, 2 kids, bought land, built house
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	NA
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	NA
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	41/17
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	2 family 10 years; single family 15, 17 years
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Haven't changed

4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Up the numbers of available and accessible
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Entirely regional
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	44
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Yes, needs smaller
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	NA
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	the zoning stinks
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	15/6
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Owned single family
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	NA
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Significant increase in affordable housing
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	Same issues island wide. Land availability different by town
	Respondent
1. How long have you lived on the Vineyard? This town?	33/15
2. What types of housing have you lived in on the Vineyard?	Single family, tent, cabin
3. Have your housing needs changed over time? If so, how?	Needed to settle down, have a real home
4. What do you believe are the primary housing issues on the Island and in your community that you hope the this planning effort will help to address?	Not enough rentals, employee housing. expensive
5. What differences, if any, do you see between housing issues in your community and Island-wide?	the same

APPENDIX III: SMALL GROUP DISCUSSIONS

Working in groups of 4-8, participants discussed the following topics.

PART A: INTRODUCTIONS AND DEBRIEFING (15 MINUTES)

I. What is your name and how long have you lived in the Island? (15 minutes)	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Karen, 30 years • Farley, 12 years • Mark, 6 • Jane, 35 • Dawn, 3.5 • Tanya, 34 • Susan, 22 YR + 10 part-time
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Judy, 23 • Tad, 23 • Mike, 73 • Paddy, 44 • Susanna, 31 • David, 30 • Vanessa, 7 • Sandra, now only part-time
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Philippe, 21 • Rick, 48 • Laura, 33 • Julieann, 39 • Heikki,, 46
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Toni, 3 days • Hyung, 13 years • Dana, 25 • Ann, 30
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • JB, part-time since 1979 • Pam, 35 years total FT though left and come back throughout • Ernie, 25 years total FT though left and come back throughout • Caroline, 23 years total FT though left and come back throughout • Daniel, 2 • Sam, 3 • Henry, 5.5
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Vickie, 61 • Doug, 15 • JC, 42 • John, 41 • Larry, 39 • Angela, 2

2. What was the most important thing you heard about your community's and the Island's housing needs in the presentation tonight?	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The lack of attention paid to those who are above the median so there is no housing available • the need for rentals in W Tisbury • Too many people have to spend too much on housing
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 63% of housing in WT is for seasonal/rec use; 83% live in a house valued at over \$500k • ~40% population qualifies as low/mod income • how few renters there are • Community is attracting too many people...exclusionary zoning • Cost burden situation is not surprising-too many people make too little in too short a season
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • No rental apartments in WT • 40B can override local zoning • SHI definition of restricted unit is very restrictive • High percent that are low/mod income and severely cost burdened • Decreasing % of younger families, ages 35-34
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 63% seasonal housing • 40B does not count the seasonal homes • \$700k cost of construction • % of people in our community who are considered low to extremely low income
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How many people really can't afford the housing they have • The declining youth population will be devastating long term • This also means that elderly residents (and others) won't have services they need • 62% of housing is seasonal-the ration of YR to seasonal may be causing problems
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Most important that we're going to actually do something about it, that we're working to develop an actionable plan • The information is hard to quantify and we are trying to make the most sense of it

3. What surprised you most about what you heard in the presentation?	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The cost of construction • No surprise, the local data was not being used in the presentation • How strict the guidelines are to qualify, seems pre-determined
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Same as Q2
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Median income seems high • Lack of rental units • High percent year-round are owner occupied • High percent of seasonal homes • Lower percent of older HHs than other towns
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 63% seasonal housing-not occupied • the fact that the younger people have to leave • High construction cost
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 62% of housing is seasonal • The median cost to construct a new house-<i>just</i> construction

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How many people are severely cost burdened
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • That the aging population wasn't as high • Questions were statistically obvious but they point in a different direction, general approach is good • 99.9% of renters are cost burdened • That only 23 units count towards the state goal

4. What unanswered questions do you have now?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Price of building and price of rent • Are you counting accessory apts? • How can we get the state to raise the median income level
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Age break down for data • How many people are on fixed income? • Multiple housing/accessory units-how many are there? What are current rules and how have they changed over time? What other options could there be? • Is there any provision in VT currently for senior housing? • What is the amount of available unbuilt land?
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What is the SHI gap for VT? • Does the DCRHA rental assistance count toward SHI • What are other programs/units that aren't/weren't counted in SHI that provide assistance and/or affordable housing?
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More data on seasonal housing-9 month-issues • Address aging population options for shifting from homeownership upkeep to smaller easier to maintain dwellings • How does economics-employment and good paying jobs, dovetail with housing solutions?
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What is the impact of weekly rentals? • Why and how is rental housing an entry point into stable, affordable housing?
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How are we going to accelerate in a major way? • How many shufflers are there and how does it affect the needs/demands?

PART B: DEFINING ISSUES AND VISIONING (25 MINUTES)

Martha's Vineyard communities need a variety of year-round housing options to provide genuine housing choice to residents and to strengthen both the individual communities and the Island as a whole.

I. How well does your community's current housing stock meet the needs of the population? Poor? Fair? Well? Why.

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. No available rentals
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. • 3-acre zoning • Single family dwelling disadvantages affordable senior housing • Missed opportunities to provide more units • Misuse of units-used for summer rentals • Recreational stock/seasonal homes is too high; disadvantages year-round populations

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Doesn't encourage diversity of ages • NIMBYism • Too much conservation land, has increased prices and decreased developable land
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Small percent of SHI, not sure how to measure
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. • Recent on-line searches show high need and low stock • Town seems to lack enforcement of town regulations that may help ensure quality of stock available
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Too many people are severely cost burdened • The cost of living is much higher • There is not enough affordable housing, too many community members have been forced out
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Double edged sword: 99.9% are severely cost burdened, this is too high an incentive to rent seasonally

2. Using perfect-world thinking, imagine that your community had a variety of housing options for a range of incomes, ages, lifestyles, family sizes and needs. What would that be like? What would that look like?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Accessory tiny houses and tiny house development • Small multi-family rentals • Envisioning converting large houses into multi-family units • Homeowners should be subsidized for creating and renting an affordable unit • Mixed cluster housing 4-8 units located near village and business district • Ability to own a home
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More diversity. More younger and older people • Different types of housing, not just single family dwellings • More density/accessory units, co-housing/tiny house situations • More multi-family housing • Diversity of type through zoning and incentives • Many more rental units • Adopt by-laws to encourage diversity and flexibility • Subsidies for seniors to redevelop their large houses into multi-family housing or apartments • Mixed use-commercial with housing • More information available about what currently exist to implement change • Town benefits from home rentals so that town can use funds to create affordable housing/town services-town needs to be sustained by income from renting out chicken coops • Ability to buy single family house-younger generation is priced out; ideally new generation can afford single family house • Fund to buy up properties before they are flipped/developed
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Housing similar to Island Elderly housing/multifamily rental housing • Dormitory housing for seasonal workers and camp grounds modeled after WT youth hostel • Converting existing housing to multifamily and making affordable • Creating greater variety of housing types and ages

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creating infrastructure in North Tisbury center to create higher density mixed use development • Housing for young families
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Have a regulated, rent controlled system for multi-unit housing • Co-housing and community housing options • Town houses • Re-zone to make possible a vision of high density housing low sprawl • Important in WT is low density housing and open space • Affordable housing that has a reputable housing ownership-possibly subsidized, cluster housing, multigenerational housing
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More co-housing and cooperative style housing, blending privacy with community, could include tiny houses, built sustainably, energy efficient and responsible • We would have more appropriate economic development to support year-round stable employment • People can connect with technology to job opps off Island • We would focus on new and different and more stable economic opportunities that don't encourage more visitors and more tourism. Maybe there are options • Zoning for cluster housing that provides affordable community housing while preserving open space • We want enough housing for all of our townspeople
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Dozen Elikiam's Way scattered around WT, 50% owned and 50% affordable rentals • Apartment buildings (e.g. Brookline) single room occupancy to apartment style • "It's a Wonderful Life" community resources provide opportunities for everyone at various stages of their life-that everyone is as utopian as I am! • Big variety of housing scattered throughout WT, with lots of farms! • Emphasis on new construction makes ??? difficult-single family, multi units, diverse selection • Creating housing for people at the right time in their lives-mixed use housing, opportunities to incentivize newcomers • Acceptance by citizenry of many dense pockets • Summer workforce housing-apartments/ tiny house • Winter college/summer housing share and employment-continued education, hostel, large house into multifamily

3. How well does the Island's current housing stock meet the needs of the population? Poor? Fair? Well? Why?	
Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Not enough diversity. Very little stock
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. See previous
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. Lack of housing
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. High pricing. Housing on the Island is a huge income producer-conflict b/t earning income and being affordable
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. See Q I
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Poor. See Q I

4. Imagine that the Island had a variety of housing options for a range of incomes, ages, lifestyles, family sizes and needs. What would that be like? What would that look like?

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Island as a whole should include the things that WT has and down-Island should provide more small unit housing because the services are there
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> More cooperation between the towns create Island wide planning solutions Island-wide tax that funds community services, hospital, affordable houses Cost-sharing for Island-wide affordable housing programs Use hospital owned housing stock for winter needs, find other employee housing situations that are used for summer help + use for year-round housing Encourage businesses to provide year-round housing for employees, not just summer employees
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Using portion of the state forest Scattered site solutions so low income housing is not in one area Work with Down-Island towns with existing or expanded infrastructure (water + sewer) to revenue/cost share to develop larger higher density missed use areas (high school/ YMCA) in OB and bypass proposal in VH Regionalization of school budget K-12 to lessen burden of school cost on down-Island towns
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Offer/have all types-single family, multi-family, apartments condos, community housing, high density dorm style for seasonal workers w barracks, married people dorm, residence Inn type units
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> WT vision applies to Island wide Our housing market wouldn't be distorted by inflated weekly rental prices
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Same as WT. That we could learn to play better together. Stop town-centricity. It's an island-wide problem, need to address with island wide solutions. Lose the border war

5. Describe any differences and similarities from what you saw for your community and for the Island.

Table A:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The commercial, office, residential is a pattern Down-Island, not here. West Tisbury is too strict
Table B:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Towns have different identities and priorities WT values low density and conservation land
Table C:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Needs to re-structure taxes to encourage greater cooperation/collaboration/partnership between and among towns
Table D:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> NA
Table E:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> WT zoning requires more acreage than other towns. We DO want to keep our rural character and support and ag community
Table F:	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Strong similarities and acceptance Down island zoning allows for denser zoning. WT may need to re-address, or more cluster homes

PART C: OPPORTUNITIES AND OBSTACLES (20 MINUTES)

We know that it is not easy to address housing issues—especially in a place with such a fragile environment, infrastructure limitations, and common public misconceptions. You know your communities best—what could work and what would never fly. With this in mind...

Using real-world thinking, what are some of the opportunities and obstacles to realizing the perfect-world envisioned in Part B above? Both in your community and Island-wide?

Table A	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Redesign zoning to encourage appropriate affordable housing, and multi-use housing • Cluster development creates communities and community involvement • High property taxes-perhaps implement the cost? • Island-wide tax similar to land bank 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Existing by-laws • Attachment to status quo • Fear that property values will decline • Fear the attraction of those who won't keep up the property • Costs!
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Real estate tax similar to the land bank • If renting your structure seasonally, place a tax on that • Make loans workable for tiny houses 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Refusal to be regional • Need to protect physical environment • Existing rules need adjusting • Who is in the need group? • Qualifications are an issue-too strict

Table B	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Soft second loans • Rooms tax as fund generator for town • Fund to buy properties before sold to a developer • Volunteer services of architects to help create plans, stave off bureaucratic nightmare • Triangle of land between N. Tisbury and Old County Rd could be developed • Create assisted living for seniors, more density • Persuading seasonal residents about this issue • Add rental above commercial space • Encourage groups like Polly Hill to create employee housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Market forces • Perceived change of Vineyard life is a disincentive • Developers pay in cash, a very high cost • Zoning • 3-acre zoning • Resistance by seasonal owners

Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Larger parcels in other towns could host scalable development, West Tisbury could share cost for proportion • More education about possibilities to increase affordable housing • Residential exemption-2 tax rates based on value of home/tax incentive or exemption for providing rental or affordable housing • Island wide planning 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Town-centric funding concerns, lack of political will • lack of political leadership-selectmen not present at meeting • Political will-perceived as unfair to tax the wealthy at a higher rate • Six towns with different identities
--------------------	--	---

Table C	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Town zoning to allow multi-family and accessory • Good will, support and awareness • Need to achieve 10% 40B and equal 10% for community and workforce housing • Learn from existing housing models 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • SHI requirement that may not meet local needs/preferences • Permanent source of local funding • MESA endangered species • high cost and scarcity of properties/land • Limited infrastructure (water/sewer)
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Plan Island wide like high school or emergency services, or models • Regional/Island-wide housing organization providing capacity? 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Large lot zoning and prohibiting higher density • Housing types • Lack of living wage • BOH enforcement/oversight of overcrowded rental housing • Lack of awareness from seasonal residents of housing issue

Table D	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • WT has scenic value, maintain rural atmosphere • If we have a higher density housing area, then there will be greater opportunities for more commercial business success and more job opps • Public transportation 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • In order to maintain large parcel properties, rural utilities delivery has a high cost • Higher density may create higher vehicle density • Be careful of creating a gated community
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Stop land bank 2% and shift to 2% housing fund • Offer voluntary income tax that will be used to support housing 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Land bank funds are not being used for housing • Having better job opportunities with higher pay • High cost of living here and building here

Table E	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We can change our zoning for more density in certain areas • Financial penalties and restrictions for things like large homes, etc. Could go into a fund • We can explore other economic opportunities to try to move away from seasonal economy • Cap on RE tax based on income? Other tax solutions? Resident tax deduction? • Long-term municipal planning-town center 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • We risk overburdening our resources (already happening) and changing our character • Inheriting family land-low income residents have trouble paying RE taxes
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Share the burden of affordable housing-e.g. down Island towns can support more density than we can, but up Island towns can help pay 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> •

Table F	Opportunities	Obstacles
Your community	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Support from the community, AHC • Growth, young people • CPA could further these things if they allowed more creative financing • Not inventing this, been doing it for 25 years with plans, there's renewed interest-crisis need • More land cause we're not as dense, more open space to create density 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Zoning? • Perception of "affordable housing", NIMBY • % of people who actually have desire to work on the opportunity to enact change • Complexity of making real progress is sometimes discouraging, long-term participation • Huge misconception of economic benefit of fixing it, don't allow market to decide. A lot of short-term thinking
Island-wide	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Towns to be open to working together • Some progress (sewering) between towns • Possibility of tax on seasonal rentals • Room tax on weekly rentals • Using MVC 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inter-town wars • Summer destination/resort town • Attracts people at much different income levels and transitions • We're preaching to the choir-it affects everyone but only a few hundred people will attend these workshops • how do we get more people involved?

Bonus question: Can you think of any realistic/feasible ways to overcome any of the obstacles your group identifies?

- Develop more community projects that attract commercial growth and community benefit (i.e., YMCA)
- Develop cottage industries to support the housing efforts-like high school building trades and marine education program, expanding to income generating industries
- Advocate to change zoning laws
- Education and promotion of the issues
- Draw more people to the issue, having it on a Saturday with childcare
- Create more year-round job opportunities so people are inclined to stay for the year to offset the seasonality (chicken and egg)