

Martha's Vineyard Commission

Hospital DRI LUPC Report

INTRODUCTION

The MVC Land Use Planning Committee (LUPC) met five times to review the Hospital DRI, analyze the extensive testimony, and formulate recommendations. LUPC hereby submits its report to the full Commission. It includes:

- Findings– a synopsis of the latest information, prepared with the assistance of staff,
- Conditions – including the Hospital’s offers and additional conditions proposed by LUPC,
- Benefits and Detriments – a draft prepared by LUPC,
- Other Recommendations – notes on several topics that LUPC felt did not warrant being the subject of conditions, but which could be included in a separate letter.

Caveat: Note that the Public Hearing will be reopened on or after December 14 for the sole purpose of receiving additional testimony about the proposed staff parking lot. Since this property was not part of the original proposal, the map and parcel numbers of this lot were not included in the public notice given for this DRI. Reopening the hearing will allow testimony from anyone who was not aware that this property is now part of the DRI application. Any draft findings of fact, draft conditions, or draft identification of benefits and detriments in this document are tentative and are subject to modification as a result of the additional testimony that may be received about the parking lot on the reopened session of the public hearing.

LUPC recommends that the Commission give preliminary approval to the portion of the project on the main Hospital property, located west of Eastville Avenue, subject to change if new unforeseen information comes out at the re-opened public hearing on the proposed staff parking lot. LUPC did not make a recommendation on the staff parking lot because of the reopening of the hearing.

FINDINGS OF FACT - DRAFT

Project Description

- The existing hospital is 140,035 square feet (sf) comprising the 1929 Hospital building (31,987 sf), the 1972 Hospital building (62,096 sf) and Windemere (45,952 sf).
- The proposal consists of 10,320 sf of demolition of the 1929 building, 800 sf of demolition of the 1972 building, and a 90,240 sf new addition with two main levels and a smaller basement.
- The new total square footage of the Hospital and Windemere will be 219,155 sf for an increase in square footage of 79,120 square feet.
- There will be an increase in medical/surgical beds of 7 (from 11 to 18), a decrease in maternity beds from 4 to 3, a 5-bed nursery, 3 intensive care rooms, and the addition of 3 observation beds.
- Non-clinical departments will remain in the 1972 wings including physician's offices, Hospice, Vineyard Nursing Association, rehab, administrative offices, records storage, and daycare.
- The Hospital also owns three other small buildings in the immediate area. The "red house" in front of the hospital is used for hospital administration. An adjacent house and another former house on Windemere Road are used by the Hospital for staff housing and the Hospital development office respectively, and are not part of this DRI application.
- The Martha's Vineyard Hospital is a private non-profit community hospital. The Hospital has signed a Memorandum of Understanding to work towards an affiliation agreement with Mass. General Hospital.

1) Location

- The proposal is to build a 90,000 square foot clinical building at an estimated cost of \$42 million, while keeping most existing facilities. The Hospital has stated that the total construction cost for rebuilding the entire required 202,000 square foot facility on an alternative site would be \$73 million, not counting the cost of land acquisition and inflation due to the delay in construction.
- The Hospital has calculated that replacing administrative and physician offices (planned for the 1972 building) on a new site would require an additional 67,000 square foot support building costing \$13 million.
- The Hospital proposes to keep the Windemere nursing home as it is, with minor exterior repairs. The Hospital has estimated that, in order to keep Windemere financially feasible, it would have to move with the Hospital, requiring construction of a 45,000 square foot building costing \$12 million. The Hospital has stated "separating the home from the hospital would increase operating costs to a point where the nursing home would not be financially viable".
- An alternate site study carried out by the MVC and the Hospital in early 2006 identified several possible alternative locations near the center of the Island, where facilities would be less exposed to many natural disaster risks, would be more central, and would have more room for parking and expansion. However, it is not clear that any of these properties is available and, if they were, at what cost.

- 65 • A proposed relocation would require a zoning amendment which Hospital administrators fear
- 66 might not be passed at Town meeting as a result of opposition which would likely be raised
- 67 by neighbors. The Hospital could end up with the current proposal, but with considerable
- 68 delay and additional expenses related to this delay due to inflation.
- 69 • Relocating the Hospital would result in a considerable delay in the project related to:
- 70 acquisition of a new piece of land, approval of a revised Determination of Need, preparation
- 71 of new architectural and engineering plans. The Hospital has estimated, based on the Mass
- 72 Department of Public Health Construction Inflation Index, that this would add 12% to the
- 73 project cost for each year of delay; so the total cost in a new location, assuming a two-year
- 74 delay, would be \$91 million.
- 75 • Hospital administrators have stated that it is not financially feasible to move the Hospital and
- 76 that the choice is not between a new Hospital in either the existing or a new location, but
- 77 rather, between proceeding with the project as presently conceived, or not proceeding at all.
- 78

79 **2) Wastewater and Stormwater**

80 Wastewater

- 81 • The site is in the Lagoon Pond watershed, a nitrogen-sensitive embayment now under study in
- 82 the Massachusetts Estuaries Project.
- 83 • The existing on-site waste treatment system treats about 12-15,000 gallons per day, with
- 84 treated effluent going into the ground draining into the Brush Pond sub-watershed, part of the
- 85 Lagoon Pond watershed. The current plant has had maintenance problems. It will be
- 86 decommissioned.
- 87 • With construction of the new hospital building, wastewater will be pumped off site to the
- 88 Town of Oak Bluffs treatment facility. The Hospital proposes a flow of up to 12.2 gallons per
- 89 minute (about 17,500 gallons per day or the design capacity equivalent of 50-55 year-round
- 90 houses, and up to 80 houses based on actual flow). The town facility has achieved a level of
- 91 nitrogen reduction about twice as good as the Hospital's plant, and effluent goes into the
- 92 ocean rather than a nitrogen-sensitive pond.
- 93 • The Hospital will pay for the infrastructure for tying in, and is making a one-time contribution
- 94 of \$75,000 to the Wastewater Commission and will pay an annual user's fee that will be
- 95 used to offset costs that would otherwise have to be borne by current users.
- 96 • Tying the Hospital into the town sewer will result in the removal of about 140 kilograms of
- 97 nitrogen per year currently going into Brush and Lagoon ponds.
- 98 • The Oak Bluffs wastewater facility has a design capacity of 370,000 gallons per day and
- 99 currently handles 165-175,000 gallons on an average midsummer day (220-225,000 on a
- 100 peak day).
- 101 • The Hospital has stated that the capacity exists to connect the two Hospital-owned residences
- 102 to the wastewater system, if grade allows; however, no facts about other issues affecting
- 103 sewerage these properties was submitted.
- 104 • Bio-medical waste will be disposed of off-Island.

105 Stormwater

- 106 • The amount of impervious area will increase from 5.4 acres to 6.6 acres.
- 107 •

- 108 • Roof runoff not absorbed by the roof garden will be directed to discharge within the 100-foot
109 shore zone around the wetlands.
- 110 • Some parking and road runoff will discharge to the 100-foot shore zone. It will be treated by
111 passing through the filters prior to discharge.
- 112 • *The off-site employee parking lot will be gravel surfaced and discharge runoff will go into the*
113 *surrounding vegetation.[Note: see caveat on page 1]*
- 114 • The stormwater collection system will be visually inspected on a quarterly cycle and
115 maintained as needed. A hydraulic inspection (pipe and structure) will be done on an annual
116 basis.
- 117 • During construction, silt fences are proposed between work areas and wetlands along both
118 sides of the entry road and along the Brush Pond wetlands.
- 119

120 **3) Open Space, Habitat, Landscaping**

- 121 • The Hospital has estimated that open space on the 13-acre site will diminish from 7-acres
122 (55%) to 5-acres (40%).
- 123 • This is not an Natural Heritage and Endangered Species Program estimated or priority habitat
124 site.
- 125 • The proposed location for the new building is largely on the parking lot in front of the 1929
126 building, but requires demolishing the front portion of that building.
- 127 • This building location requires extensive fill and retaining walls to raise the building to the
128 same ground floor level as the existing building and out of the 100-year flood plain. The front
129 access road and associated parking areas will also be elevated.
- 130 • A retaining wall to support the raised elevation of the area in front of the new building and to
131 separate the new road from the wetland buffer will be about 10-feet high at its highest point
132 and will be topped with a guardrail.
- 133 • There will be a 50' wide vegetated buffer along Beach Road. The parking area extending
134 along the entrance drive will be landscaped with native plants.
- 135 • New landscaping will use primarily low maintenance and native plants to minimize the need
136 for fertilization.
- 137 • The Hospital has stated that it has a budget of \$150,000 for landscaping.
- 138

139 **4) Lighting and Noise**

- 140 • New lighting will be designed and existing lighting will be upgraded to prevent up-lighting
141 and light from spilling off the property. Exterior light fixtures will use metal halide bulbs. Pole
142 heights will not exceed 12-feet.
- 143

144 **5) Energy and Sustainability**

- 145 • The new hospital building has been registered with the United States Green Building Council
146 in the LEED (Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design) certification program. The
147 Hospital will be the first LEED certified building on the Island and possibly the first LEED
148 certified hospital in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts.

149

150 **6) Traffic and Transportation**

151 Access

- 152 • The Hospital will continue to have two access points, the main entrance from Beach Road and
- 153 the side entrance from Eastville Avenue.
- 154 • A perimeter road is proposed that would allow access to any part of the site from either
- 155 access point.
- 156 • A new emergency access will be created at the end of Temahigan Avenue, to allow access
- 157 should Beach Road and Eastville Avenue be inaccessible due to exceptional storm conditions.

158

159 Traffic

- 160 • The number of trips on an average summer weekday in 2026 with the proposed expansion
- 161 computed in the Traffic Impact Analysis (prepared by Fay, Spofford and Thorndike and
- 162 reviewed by C3 Consulting) is projected to increase gradually from 2,460 (half in and half
- 163 out) to 3,851, due to increased use related to population growth. The number during the
- 164 morning peak is projected to increase from 168 to 263.
- 165 • Traffic levels are projected to increase by 2-3% on most surrounding streets.
- 166 • The Hospital has offered to implement a series of traffic mitigation measures.

167

168 Parking

- 169 • Currently, there are 260 public parking spaces (and 22 unmarked and utility vehicle spaces).
- 170 The projected parking demand is 338 spaces in the short term, and 360 spaces in the long
- 171 term.
- 172 • *The proposal is to bring the number of parking places to 270 spaces on the existing site and*
- 173 *to create an employee parking lot across Eastville Road on property owned by the*
- 174 *Massachusetts Department of Mental Health for an additional 55 spaces, resulting in a total of*
- 175 *325 spaces. [Note caveat on page 1]*
- 176 • The Hospital has estimated that it would cost approximately \$5 million to build parking under
- 177 the Hospital building and this would result in a significant delay due to the need to redesign
- 178 the project. It has estimated that it would cost approximately \$3 million to build a two-level
- 179 parking structure. The Hospital also stated that since there is not sufficient exterior space to
- 180 accommodate such a structure, this would require demolition of a wing of the building, which
- 181 would require some facilities to move off-site which would impact the Hospital's operations.

182

183 Multi-User Path

- 184 • The Multi-User Path – to accommodate bicycles, pedestrians, and other non-motorized forms
- 185 of transportation – will be relocated to provide for a totally exclusive path through the hospital
- 186 property, to be linked (by others) to an off-road Multi-User Path joining Vineyard Haven and
- 187 Oak Bluffs.

188

189 **7) Building Design, Scenic Values, Character and Identity**

- 190 • The proposed building will be visually prominent, especially from Beach Road. The ground
- 191 level where the front of the building is to be built is to be raised ten feet and the proposed

192 building height is forty feet (fifty feet to the top of the tower). Also, the building is about 200
193 feet closer to Beach Road than the existing 1929 building.

- 194 • The proposed exterior elevations are being redesigned to be completely in brick in order to
195 comply with the Coastal Construction Code, requiring ability to withstand 120 mph winds.
196 The architects plan to submit revised exterior elevations in mid-December 2006.

197
198 **8) Housing**

- 199 • During the summer the Hospital has 33 housing units available that are used to house up to
200 63 seasonal employees. During the winter they have 18 units and house 34 employees. The
201 hospital spends more than \$600,000 a year on housing for its employees. The Applicant has
202 indicated that it is in the early stages of planning to build housing to accommodate their
203 needs.
- 204 • The Hospital estimates that this expansion will increase the number of employees by 2 in the
205 short term and 4 new employees in ten years.
- 206 • The Hospital has stated that, due to the economics and availability of on-Island housing, the
207 majority of the construction work force will commute daily to the Island. Only a small
208 supervisory staff will be housed on-Island for the duration of construction.

209
210 **9) Risk from Natural Hazards**

- 211 • A risk and vulnerability assessment for the Hospital was performed by the Woods Hole Group
212 using the methodology outlined for the Risk and Vulnerability Assessment Tool prepared by the
213 National Oceanic and Atmospheric Administration's Coastal Services Center. This
214 methodology involves ranking hazards in terms of severity of impact, identifying areas at risk
215 from the natural hazards, and then assessing vulnerability to the risks. A second more detailed
216 vulnerability component was added to assess damages to critical hospital services and
217 systems that might impact the performance objective of the hospital.
- 218 • Based on the size of the impact zone, the frequency of the hazard, and the potential
219 magnitude of the impact, the highest ranking hazards were found to be storm surge and
220 flooding, wind, and snowfall. Other hazards evaluated include wildfire, coastal erosion, sea-
221 level rise, and earthquakes.
- 222 • Estimates of flooding caused by nor'easters and hurricanes during the 10-, 50-, and 100-yr
223 storms were obtained from the FEMA Flood Insurance Study, derived using high water marks
224 recorded during historical storms. Flood elevations for the 10-, 50-, and 100-yr storms were
225 4.1, 7.0, and 8.5 ft, respectively. The ground floor of the existing Hospital as well as the new
226 building is 17.5 ft.
- 227 • Worst-case storm surge elevations were obtained from the US Army Corps of Engineers
228 Southern Massachusetts Hurricane Evacuation Study. Maximum surge elevations predicted by
229 the SLOSH computer model for Category 1, 2, 3, and 4 hurricanes were 6.7, 10.6, 14.5,
230 and 16.9 ft, respectively. These surge elevations represent the highest possible flooding that
231 could occur from critical combinations of hurricane track direction, forward speed, landfall
232 location, and high astronomical tide. Storm surges above 7.2 ft have never been recorded in
233 Vineyard Haven Harbor. Potential frequency of occurrence estimates for the Category 1, 2, 3,
234 and 4 surge levels was computed based on historical hurricane wind speeds. Although direct
235 correlations between hurricane wind speed and storm surge cannot be made, the frequency
236 estimates based on wind speed provide an upper limit to the probability of surge events at the

237 hospital site. Actual frequencies of Category 3 and 4 surge levels predicted by the SLOSH
238 model are considered low enough to be statistically insignificant (for example, the likelihood
239 that a storm would produce a surge higher than elevation 14.5 ft is roughly 1 in 650; in 100
240 years from now, assuming sea level rise of 2', the likelihood would rise to roughly 1 in 200.)
241 • Per the Massachusetts State Building Code, the design wind load velocities for Martha's
242 Vineyard are 90 mph. FEMA's Coastal Construction Manual recommends more stringent
243 wind load design criterion of 120 mph for construction projects within this area of the coastal
244 zone.
245 • Sea-level Rise – Predictions for future rates of global sea-level rise were obtained from the
246 International Panel on Climate Change (2001). Over the period 1990 to 2100, these
247 estimates range between 0.29 and 2.9 ft.
248 • The Woods Hole Group estimated the risks associated with flooding and storm surge hazards
249 on the performance objective of the Hospital to continue to operate and serve the island
250 community with a minimum of disruption, both during and immediately after a natural hazard
251 emergency. They concluded that the risk and associated vulnerability to flooding and storm
252 surge during SLOSH Category 1 and 2 hurricanes was low. Mitigation activities including
253 site grading and building upgrades to meet the more stringent 120 mph wind load
254 recommended by FEMA, were found to reduce risks and vulnerability associated with the
255 SLOSH Category 3 events to low. Because of the extremely low probability of occurrence,
256 risks associated with the SLOSH Category 4 hurricane event were also found to be low.
257

258 **10) Construction Process**

- 259 • The Hospital has outlined a three-year construction process showing what work will take place
260 and how access and parking will be organized in each of four phases (see Conditions).
261 • The total estimated quantity of fill material is 23,000 cubic yards. 17,000 cubic yards of this
262 will be obtained from an on-Island source such as Goodale Construction. 6,000 cubic yards
263 (aggregate base and processed gravel sub-base material for under the concrete slabs and
264 bituminous paving) will come from off-Island sources by barge.

265

POSSIBLE CONDITIONS (Note: Applicant offers are so indicated) - *DRAFT*

265
266
267
268
269
270
271
272
273
274
275
276
277
278
279
280
281
282
283
284
285
286
287
288
289
290
291
292
293
294
295
296
297
298
299
300
301
302

1 Storm/ Risk

- 1.1 As offered by the Applicant, the emergency generator and fuel tank shall be elevated above the SLOSH predicted surge level of 14.6 ft (NGVD) for a Category 3 hurricane event. .
- 1.2 As offered by the Applicant, the perimeter access road shall be redesigned near Eastville Avenue to allow access to the hospital during a Category 3 event as predicted by the SLOSH model (i.e. raised 1-2 feet in some areas).
- 1.3 As offered by the Applicant, the design of the building shall be upgraded to meet wind loads of 120mph, as recommended by FEMA's Coastal Construction Manual.
- 1.4 As offered by the Applicant, an emergency access shall be created to provide direct access to the perimeter road from the end of Temahigan, to be used only in case access via Beach Road and/or Eastville Avenue are temporarily blocked.
- 1.5 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall modify the evacuation plan throughout the phasing of the construction process and upon completion of construction, in cooperation with the Oak Bluffs Emergency Management Director.

2 Wastewater

- 2.1 As offered by the Applicant, all wastewater shall be pumped off site and treated at the Town of Oak Bluffs wastewater treatment facility, at the expense of the MV Hospital.
- 2.2 As offered by the Applicant, the existing on-site wastewater treatment plant shall be decommissioned and demolished.
- 2.3 A Waste Stream Management Plan shall be submitted to and is subject to the approval of the LUPC. This plan shall clarify and detail how discharge of toxic and hazardous materials in the wastewater shall be minimized. The plan shall include RCRA listed wastes and identify appropriate BMPs to assure that solvents, photographic chemicals, radionuclides, surplus, unused or formulary-changed pharmaceuticals and commingled or potentially toxic wastes are properly categorized, handled and disposed in a manner that will not adversely impact the operation of the Oak Bluffs Wastewater Treatment facility.

3 Groundwater And Stormwater Management

- 3.1 As offered by the Applicant, all existing and proposed stormwater catch basins shall be fitted with ABTech's Ultra-Urban filters model DI2020N or equivalent.
- 3.2 As offered by the Applicant, roof runoff not absorbed by the roof garden shall be directed to discharge within the 100-foot shore zone around the wetlands.
- 3.3 As offered by the Applicant, all runoff from parking and road discharging into the 100-foot shore zone shall be treated by passing through the filters prior to discharge.

- 303 3.4 As offered by the Applicant, the remote employee parking shall be gravel surfaced and
304 shall discharge runoff into the surrounding vegetation.
- 305 3.5 As offered by the Applicant, the stormwater collection system will be visually inspected on
306 a quarterly cycle and maintained as needed; a hydraulic inspection (pipe and structure)
307 will be done on an annual basis. [Note: modified by condition 3.11]
- 308 3.6 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall enforce its Sedimentation and Erosion Plan,
309 which lists steps that subcontractors must follow to minimize impacts from erosion.
- 310 3.7 As offered by the Applicant, silt fences shall be installed and maintained between work
311 areas and wetlands along both sides of the entry road and along the Brush Pond
312 wetlands.
- 313 3.8 As offered by the Applicant, a final Sedimentation and Erosion Control plan shall be
314 submitted to and is subject to the approval of the Oak Bluffs Conservation Commission
315 before the start of construction. (Note: modified by condition 3.10)
- 316 3.9 As offered by the Applicant, a final Stormwater Management Plan including a detailed
317 management program and final location of stormwater discharge points shall be submitted
318 to and is subject to the approval of the Oak Bluffs Conservation Commission before the
319 start of construction. (Note: modified by condition 3.10)
- 320 3.10 The final Sedimentation and Erosion Control plan and final Stormwater Management Plan
321 shall be submitted to and is subject to the approval of the LUPC before the start of
322 construction.
- 323 3.11 The Stormwater Management Plan shall include the following elements.
324 • Address the current runoff discharge near the tank farm, the planned use of the two
325 catch basins near the entrance to the helicopter pad and provide sufficient design
326 elements to clarify the planned runoff from the 1.9 acre impervious surface parking
327 and road area in a manner to maximize even distribution to the natural vegetation.
328 • Clearly identify all catch basins that will be fitted with UltraUrban Filters as per
329 condition 3.1.
330 • Replacement of the Ultra-Urban filters at intervals no greater than one year and
331 removal of grit and debris from the screen at quarterly intervals. The plan shall clarify
332 the chain of responsibility for stormwater system maintenance. Maintenance reports
333 shall be submitted to the MVC.
334 • Design detail for planned surface stormwater discharges along Hospital Road
335 including the use of riprap, level lip spreaders or vegetated berms to evenly distribute
336 the runoff into the natural vegetation.
337 • Design detail on dispersing roof water in manner that prevents erosion in the Shore
338 Zone.
339 • Design detail on any proposed structures (both vegetative and structural) that differ
340 from the Stormwater management Plan dated 7/27/06.
- 341 3.12 The Hospital shall only use environmentally sound de-icing materials such as calcium
342 chloride, CMA, sand and similar products on the roadways and parking surface.

343 3.13 The Hospital shall not re-surface the paved parking area with asphalt sealers or coal tar
344 sealers, to prevent runoff containing PAH pollutants.

345

346 **4 Multi-User Paths, Bicycles, and Pedestrians**

347 4.1 As offered by the Applicant, there shall be an exclusive Multi-User Path (MUP) through the
348 Hospital property via continued use of Linton Lane. The driveway to the hospital's red
349 house will be converted to a paved bike path as shown in the Plan The Applicant agrees
350 to grant a permanent easement for this MUP to enable possible MassHighway funding for
351 the construction. In addition, there shall be a shared bike route along the perimeter road
352 of the campus.

353 4.2 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall grant a permanent easement along the
354 right-of-way of Eastville Avenue to allow an appropriately sized and buffered MUP to be
355 created in the future at other's expense.

356 4.3 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall provide the following to accommodate
357 bicycles:

- 358 • Incorporate bicycle storage facilities for at least 50 bicycles dispersed at several
359 locations on the Hospital campus, close to the busiest staff/volunteer building
360 access points.
- 361 • Design the new perimeter road and clearly post it to allow staff and visitor
362 bicyclists to 'share the road'.
- 363 • Provide showers and locker rooms for employees to encourage commuting by
364 bicycle.
- 365 • Provide employee incentives to bike to work, especially during the peak season.
- 366 • Post signs with regularity along the perimeter road to caution parking motorists to
367 back out slowly and watch for bicyclists.
- 368 • Consider a financial contribution to the design of future bikeway enhancements
369 between the Lagoon Pond Drawbridge and the Hospital campus.

370

371 **5 Architecture**

372 5.1 As offered by the Applicant, a final design for the exterior of the building clad in brick
373 shall be submitted to and is subject to the approval of the Commission before the issuance
374 of the building permit. The design shall be substantially as shown in the plans previously
375 submitted except that the exterior materials shall be brick and stone, and there may be
376 modifications to the architectural detailing (e.g. gables, fenestration, trim, colors, etc.)
377 including limited changes to the building articulation.

378 **6 Landscaping**

379 6.1 As offered by the Applicant, a final landscape plan for each area of the site, shall be
380 submitted to and is subject to the approval of the Commission before beginning the
381 landscaping of that area. The areas to be landscaped shall be substantially as shown on
382 the preliminary landscape plan but with provision of: denser vegetation, screening for
383 abutters, protection of wetlands, softening of the visual impact of the building from the

- 384 public way, tree canopy and planted breaks in parking areas, and preservation of
 385 existing trees where possible. [Note: modified by condition 6.4]
- 386 6.2 As offered by the Applicant, primarily native and low-maintenance plants shall be used in
 387 the areas proposed for new landscaping, to minimize the need for fertilization and
 388 watering.
- 389 6.3 As offered by the Applicant, all fertilizers shall be slow-release, water-insoluble nitrogen
 390 source types. No synthetic pesticides including herbicides, fungicides and insecticides
 391 shall be used in the maintenance of landscaping.
- 392 6.4 The final landscape plan shall also clarify the following items:
 393 - the design and the grading of the Multi-User Path,
 394 - the screening of all retaining walls, and
 395 - pedestrian paths for links from Beach Road to the main entrance, from Eastville
 396 Avenue to the side entrance, from parking areas to Hospital entrances, and from
 397 the Hospital to Brush Pond;
 398 - signage
- 399 **7 Exterior Lighting**
- 400 7.1 As offered by the Applicant, a final lighting plan for the all buildings and exterior areas
 401 shall be submitted for the review of and is subject to the approval of the LUPC.
- 402 7.2 As offered by the Applicant, all new and existing exterior lighting shall be downward
 403 shielded to prevent direct light from spilling off the property.
- 404 7.3 As offered by the Applicant, lighting pole heights shall not exceed 12-feet.
- 405 7.4 As offered by the Applicant, lighting in the new staff parking lot shall be limited to low
 406 bollard lights on motion detectors.
- 407 **8 Noise**
- 408 8.1 As offered by the Applicant, screen walls shall be installed to reduce the impact of the
 409 noise generated by the new chillers in the mechanical yard.
- 410 **9 Energy / Sustainability**
- 411 9.1 As offered by the Applicant, the new building shall be registered with the United States
 412 Green Building Council in the LEED (Leadership in Energy and Environmental Design)
 413 certification program.
- 414 9.2 As offered by the Applicant, the new building's compliance with the Massachusetts Energy
 415 Code shall be documented using ComCheck software and the architectural envelope shall
 416 exceed the minimum Energy Code requirements by at least 15%
- 417 9.3 As offered by the Applicant, all lighting fixtures and bulbs will be Energy Star.
- 418 9.4 As offered by the Applicant, the project shall include a roof top garden and other roof
 419 systems to reduce heat generation;

420 9.5 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall provide preferred parking spots for hybrid
421 vehicles and carpooling vehicles.

422

423 **10 Solid Waste Management**

424 10.1 As offered by the Applicant, the new facility shall provide for the collection and storage of
425 the Hospital's recyclables.

426 10.2 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall encourage recycling of as much material as
427 possible before and during demolition.

428 10.3 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall remove asbestos using appropriate
429 removal, handling, and disposal techniques.

430 10.4 As offered by the Applicant, at least 75% of demolition debris shall be recycled.

431 10.5 As offered by the Applicant, bio-medical waste shall be disposed of off the Island.

432 **11 A.D.A. Accessibility**

433 11.1 As offered by the Applicant, the project shall be A.D.A. compliant

434 **12 Traffic and Transportation**

435 12.1 As offered by the Applicant, the Applicant shall increase its efforts to encourage hospital
436 workers and volunteers to bike/walk to and from the Hospital or use existing Martha's
437 Vineyard Transit Authority services during and after construction and the peak summer
438 months.

439 12.2 As offered by the Applicant, the Applicant shall provide economic incentives to workers to
440 use alternative modes to get to the hospital to reduce the potential that the supply of
441 parking becomes overburdened.

442 12.3 As offered by the Applicant, during construction, the Applicant shall maintain or increase
443 the existing parking supply on the overall campus, particularly during the summer months.

444 12.4 *As offered by the Applicant, the Applicant shall, as an early action, construct the staff*
445 *parking lot to help handle parking demand. [Note: see caveat on page 1]*

446 12.5 As offered by the Applicant, the Applicant shall schedule services (e.g., AA meetings) at
447 alternative times such that peak parking demands (typically occurring from 11am – noon)
448 are reduced.

449 12.6 As offered by the Applicant, the Applicant shall delineate staff parking such that staff will
450 not occupy higher turnover parking spaces. It may be necessary for the Hospital to
451 implement a system to enforce staff parking. [Note: modified by condition 12.12]

452 12.7 As offered by the Applicant, the internal roadway speed limit shall be retained at 10 mph
453 and the Applicant shall consider 'traffic calming' features on the new perimeter hospital
454 road to deter 'cut-through' traffic and speeding.

- 455 12.8 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall incorporate the potential new MVTA bus
456 stop at the hospital entrance on the plan and continue to accommodate the bus stops on
457 Beach Road.
- 458 12.9 As offered by the Applicant, the portion of the driveway approaching Eastville Avenue
459 shall be widened between the rear parking areas and the front parking area to provide a
460 20-foot wide paved cross-section.
- 461 12.10 As offered by the Applicant, the telephone pole just east of the emergency driveway shall
462 be relocated back further from the edge of the road (preferably at least 6 feet behind its
463 current location).
- 464 12.11 All roads on the Hospital site shall be no more than 20' wide, except in areas where
465 parked cars back into the road where they shall be no more than 24' wide.
- 466 12.12 The Hospital shall work with the Town of Oak Bluffs, MassHighway, and the Martha's
467 Vineyard Commission to determine what safety improvements, if any, should be made to
468 the intersection of Eastville and Temahigan avenues, including the possible addition of a
469 crosswalk and pedestrian paths and/or sidewalk between the new staff parking lot and
470 the Hospital. The Hospital shall contribute a share of the Town of Oak Bluffs' costs for this
471 improvement, if any, based on the proportion that the Hospital contributes to the need for
472 this improvement.
- 473 12.13 *As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital proposes to construct a staff parking lot on the
474 Department of Mental Health property on Temahigan, to be built according to the design
475 submitted on November 16, 2006. This lot shall include no more than 55 parking spaces,
476 shall be surfaced in gravel, and shall preserve all large trees other than those in the
477 planned internal roadways. Existing wooded landscaping in the buffers around the
478 parking shall remain as undisturbed as possible. Additional low evergreen landscaping
479 shall be planted within the buffers at thin areas as needed to provide adequate screening
480 of the parking area. [See condition 12.14] [Note: see caveat on page 1]*
- 481 12.14 *The Hospital shall set up a system to ensure that staff members don't park in visitors
482 parking. [Note: see caveat on page 1]*
- 483 12.15 *The entry road to the new staff parking lot on Temahigan Avenue shall be a maximum of
484 18' wide. The minimum setback of the parking area shall be 30' from Temahigan Avenue,
485 shall be 20' from the State Police property, shall be 50' from the rear property line, and
486 shall be 70' from the corner property. [Note: see caveat on page 1]*
- 487 12.16 *Parking by Hospital staff members shall be permitted between the hours of 6:30 am and
488 6:30 pm. No overnight parking, storage of equipment, or staging of materials will be
489 permitted on this lot.*

490

491 **13. Construction Process**

- 492 13.1 As offered by the Applicant: construction work will be performed on Monday through
493 Friday, excluding holidays observed in the construction industry and by the Hospital, from

- 494 7:00 am to 6:00 pm. Some exception to this schedule will occur dufor a limited number of
495 activities such as finishing concrete slabs.
- 496 13.2 As offered by the Applicant, limitations will be set on the number of major pieces of
497 construction equipment operating at any one time. Equipment operation will be strictly
498 restricted to within the 7:00 am to 6:00 pm work period. Excessive idling of equipment
499 not in use will not be permitted. Where possible, equipment will be located so as to
500 minimize noise impact in the surrounding area. At all times noise levels will be maintained
501 within OSHA requirements.
- 502 13.3 As offered by the Applicant, on-site parking for the construction workers will be restricted
503 to within the designated construction area. Parking on site will be limited to one personal
504 vehicle per subcontractor. Parking for the personal vehicles of all other construction
505 workers will be located at the designated off-site staging area(s) and shuttle service will be
506 provided.
- 507 13.4 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall use the following measures to encourage
508 hiring of local sub-contractors and workers:
- 509 • During the subcontractor bidding process, notifications will be published in the
510 local newspapers, as well as in the Dodge Construction Reports.
 - 511 • A location will be established at the existing Hospital where the final bid
512 documents can be viewed by interested subcontractors from the Island.
 - 513 • All legitimate bids from qualified subcontractors will be accepted and considered.
514 The subcontractors selected for the project, whether local or off-Island, will be
515 required to accept and seriously consider applications from qualified members of
516 the local workforce, for their specific trade categories, whether it be skilled or
517 unskilled.
 - 518 • Applications for such positions will be available and will be accepted at the on-site
519 Construction Office throughout the project construction period.
- 520 13.5 As offered by the Applicant, the Hospital shall notify all contractors and sub-contractors of
521 the weight limitations on the Lagoon Pond Drawbridge, shall require that trucks exceeding
522 these limites use the alternative truck rout as defined by the Oak Bluffs and Tisbury Boards
523 of Selectmen.
- 524 13.6 The Hospital shall prepare a Construction Management Program for on- and off-site
525 staging and construction, in order to maximize safety, to minimize the disruption of
526 Hospital operations, to minimize noise, vibrations and other impacts of construction on
527 users, staff and abutters, to ensure the provision of adequate parking, and to ensure the
528 presence of safe pedestrian and bicycle paths. This plan shall be submitted to and is
529 subject to the approval of the Oak Bluffs Board of Selectmen or the responsible town
530 authority designated by the Board of Selectmen.
- 531 13.7 No parking of construction vehicles, storage of equipment, or staging of materials will be
532 permitted on the two properties owned by the Hospital on Windemere Road.
533

BENEFITS AND DETRIMENTS - DRAFT

1) Location

Benefits: This location for the construction of the new Hospital facility, compared to relocating it in a hypothetical new mid-Island location, offers the following benefits.

- It allows continued use of most existing buildings including Windemere and the 1972 section.
- According to Hospital estimates, it would cost less than half of the cost of moving to a new location. . The Applicants maintain that this is the most financially viable and responsible solution.
- By not moving, the project would not face a delay, possibly of several years, related to: acquisition of a new piece of land, approval of a revised Determination of Need, and preparation of new architectural and engineering plans.
- The project would not be subject to the uncertainty related to obtaining a zoning change, as would be required in an alternative location.
- On this site, there is no impact on significant habitat, whereas rebuilding on a mid-Island site would probably involve habitat destruction.
- On this site, it is relatively easy to tie into the sewer system, whereas this might likely be more difficult for a site located in the center of the Island.
- This site is an in-town, infill, "Smart Growth" location, especially compared to major new development in a rural area.
- This site is on three bus routes and on one of the Island's main bike paths.
- It is the Hospital's historic location and the community is used to it being here.
- Helicopter access to the helipad takes place over water, which is preferred compared to flight paths over trees or residential areas.

Detriments: This location has the following detriments compared to an alternative location near the center of the Island.

- The current site and its access roads are more exposed to the risk from storm-related natural hazards, although this risk has been mitigated to some extent by modifications to the Hospital plan and with the Oak Bluffs Emergency Management Plan.
- Fitting all the Hospital's requirements into this constrained site has resulted in considerable alteration to the site and a building that would likely be much more visible than if it were located on a larger, wooded, mid-Island site.
- The Hospital construction and operations will negatively impact the surrounding neighborhood, although it is unknown how many people would be similarly impacted in an alternative location.
- Rebuilding on this site does not allow for creating an all-new facility that is efficiently planned and does not involve continued use of several partially deteriorated buildings.
- Rebuilding on the same site leads to many logistical challenges and expenses related to maintaining Hospital operations during construction, requiring elaborate phasing, staging and coordination and resulting in inconvenience and disruption to patients, employees, abutters, and passers by.

- 577 • Construction may overlap with the construction of the Drawbridge, adding to disruption in
578 the area.
579

580
581 **2) Wastewater and Stormwater**

582
583 Benefits

- 584 • All the Hospital's wastewater will be treated at the Town's wastewater plant which should
585 halve the amount of nitrogen released into the eco-system; the remainder will be released
586 into the ocean rather than the nitrogen-sensitive Brush and Lagoon Ponds.
587 • The Hospital will make a significant one-time contribution and annual payments to the
588 Wastewater Commission that will allow freezing the rates for taxpayers.
589 • Will allow decommissioning the Hospital's existing wastewater treatment facility, thereby
590 relieving the Hospital from the responsibility and cost associated with its maintenance
591 • Filters will be installed in all catch basins to deal with hydrocarbon and other sediments in
592 runoff.
593

594 Detriments

- 595 • The Hospital will use almost 5% of the capacity of the Town's wastewater treatment facility
596 that otherwise could have been used to treat the wastewater of homes or businesses that
597 presently have no nitrogen reduction.
598 • The project site will generate large volumes of runoff from the increased impervious areas.
599

600 **3) Open Space, Habitat, Landscaping**

601
602 Benefits

- 603 • The project is not in a critical habitat area.
604 • The wastewater improvements would positively impact the natural environment of Brush
605 and Lagoon ponds.
606

607 Detriments

- 608 • Many trees will be cut and much screening vegetation removed, notably along the entry
609 road and in front of the 1929 building.
610 • Regrading close to wetlands raises concern, though extensive mitigation measures have
611 been proposed and will be reviewed by Oak Bluffs Conservation Commission.
612 • The construction of the staff parking lot will result in removal of most of the vegetation in
613 an area presently naturally vegetated . However, most large trees will be preserved and
614 the proposal will result in the preservation of about an acre of natural vegetation. [Note:
615 see caveat on page 1]
616

617 **4) Lighting and Noise**

618
619 Benefits

- 620 • All exterior lighting will be down-lighting.
621 • Noise should be limited, except during construction.

622
623
624
625
626
627
628
629
630
631
632
633
634
635
636
637
638
639
640
641
642
643
644
645
646
647
648
649
650
651
652
653
654
655
656
657
658
659
660
661
662
663
664
665
666

Detriments

- The new building will be highly visible at night because of light shining from windows.

5) Energy and Sustainability

Benefits

- The Hospital will incorporate extensive energy efficiency and other sustainability measures that will make it one of the few LEED-certified hospitals in the United States.

6) Traffic and Transportation

Benefits

- The internal site vehicular circulation is much improved with a road layout that provides access to all parts of the site from both entrances.
- An off-road Multi-User Path is incorporated in the plan.
- There are many positive transportation mitigation measures
- The Temahigan staff parking lot adds to the overall supply of Hospital parking and frees up parking spaces close to the building for use by visitors. The parking lot proposal includes the preservation of significant areas of vegetation that will minimize the impact on abutters and on scenic values, especially compared to as-of-right development permissible under zoning, namely three houses with "Approval Not Required" resulting in no review of the building or landscape design by the MVC or any town board. The inclusion of this property in the application means that any future development of this property will be subject to MVC review. [Note: see caveat on page 1]
- The provision of off-site parking allows for accommodation of the short and medium term projected parking needs without requiring the significant expenditure required for a parking structure or underground parking, without having to demolish part of the existing building to accommodate a parking structure, and without a significant delay to the project that would be associated with revising the design to accommodate underground parking.

Detriments

- It is difficult to provide all the required parking on the existing site in a cost-effective way
- The Temahigan staff parking lot involves building a large parking lot in a residential area and will result in pedestrians having to cross Eastville Avenue with related safety concerns. [Note: see caveat on page 1]
- There will be additional truck traffic and related disruption during construction, not only in the immediate vicinity, but also at the intersection of Barnes Road and the Edgartown – Vineyard Haven Road.
- There will be an overall increase in ongoing traffic to the Hospital and its related impacts; however, this increase and these impacts are limited and would happen anyway due to population growth.

667 **7) Building Design, Scenic Values, Character and Identity**

668

669 Benefits

- 670 • The building will be an important public building for Martha's Vineyard, easily identifiable
- 671 as the community's hospital.
- 672 • The compact, two-story design limits the amount of land needed to accommodate the
- 673 program.

674

675 Detriments

- 676 • The height and width of the new building and its proximity to Beach Road will result in
- 677 much greater visual impact from land and sea.
- 678 • The visual impact as seen from Beach Road will be increased because of the removal of
- 679 some existing vegetation in front of the building,
- 680 • The new Hospital building will be a large institutional building close to historic and
- 681 residential areas.

682

683 **8) Housing**

684

685 The Hospital continues to make a significant effort to house its staff and the Commission counts on

686 its good faith to do this in the future.

687

688 **9) Impact on Abutters**

689

690 Detriments

- 691 • Abutters will be significantly impacted short term, during the construction process.
- 692 • The greatly increased visibility of the building as well as the modest increases in vehicular
- 693 traffic will also impact abutters.

694

695 **10) Risk from Natural Hazards**

696

697 Benefits

- 698 • The new Hospital building will designed and constructed to be much less vulnerable to
- 699 damages caused by natural hazards than the existing Hospital.

700

701 Detriments

- 702 • Because of its location close to the coast, the Hospital will be exposed to some risk from
- 703 flooding during storms and from other natural hazards, though these have been mitigated
- 704 by a series of design features and other measures.

705

706 **11) Construction Process**

707

708 Benefits

- 709 • The project will contribute to the local economy by providing jobs to local subcontractors
- 710 and workers, and providing business to local suppliers and retailers.

711

712 Detriments

- 713 • The construction will have a significant impact on Hospital operations, users, staff, and
714 abutters, though these impacts will be mitigated with the proposed measures.

715
716 **12) Impact on Municipal Services and Burden on Taxpayers**

717
718 Benefits

- 719 • The Hospital will be tied into town sewer at the Hospital's expense.

720
721 Detriments

- 722 • The expansion of the Hospital will place additional ongoing demands on town services
723 such as police and fire.
724 • The design, permitting, and construction process will place demands on town departments
725 and boards.
726 • The Hospital will use some of the capacity of the town wastewater treatment.

727
728
729 **13) Uses or Impacts Other Public Facilities**

730
731 Benefits

- 732 • The project will allow the Hospital – a quasi-public facility – to better serve the needs of
733 the Martha's Vineyard community with a new, first-class, medical facility.

734
735 Detriments

- 736 • The construction process will place demands on the Steamship Authority and barging,
737 though the impact on the public will be mitigated by the fact that most of this
738 transportation is being scheduled to take place at off-peak times of the year.

739
740 **14) Consistency with, Ability to Achieve Town, Regional, State Plans/Objectives**

741
742 Benefits

- 743 • The project is supported by the Oak Bluffs Board of Selectmen

744
745
746 **15) Conforms to Zoning**

- 747 • The current Hospital site conforms to the Oak Bluffs zoning for a Health Care District. Since
748 the Hospital has more than 100,000 square feet, it will require a Special Permit from the Oak
749 Bluffs Board of Appeals.
750 • *The conformity of the proposed off-site parking is being examined by Hospital and Oak Bluff*
751 *officials. It would appear that a parking lot that serves a medical facility is not allowed by*
752 *zoning. However, it may be that the Commonwealth pre-empts local zoning if it is considered*
753 *that the Department of Mental Health's provision of this land is part of the Department's*
754 *mission, in that it helps the Hospital fulfill its mission which includes dealing with mental*
755 *health. [Note: see caveat on page 1]*

756

757 **16) Conforms to DCPC Regulations**

758

759 The Hospital is located in the Coastal DCPC and appears to conform to its regulations (the Town
760 will make this determination)..

761

OTHER RECOMMENDATIONS (for possible inclusion in separate letter)

761
762
763
764
765
766
767
768
769
770
771
772
773
774
775
776
777
778

The Commission urges the Hospital to avoid noisy construction activities in the early morning during the summer.

The Commission suggests that the Hospital look at the possibility of introducing a curve into the entry road in order to reduce the visual impact.

The Commission urges the Hospital and the Oak Bluffs Wastewater Commissioners to tie in the three houses owned by the Hospital to be tied into the sewer system, if feasible.

The construction staging will be reviewed by local authorities.